

MINUTES OF THE MEETING
TECHNICAL COMMITTEE ON
STRUCTURAL AND PROXIMITY FIRE FIGHTING
PROTECTIVE CLOTHING AND EQUIPMENT
PALM SPRINGS, CALIFORNIA
15 -- 17 JUNE 2010

15 JUNE 2010

Agenda Item 1-3: Call to Order, Introduction of Members and Guests, and Committee Procedures

TC Chairman Stephen King called the meeting to order at 09.00. Chairman King then called for an introduction of Members and guests. The following Members and guests were present:

Members Present:

Stephen King, Chairman	FDNY, Retired
Benjamin Mauti, Secretary	MSA
Bruce Teele	NFPA Staff Liaison
Dave Trebisacci	NFPA Staff Liaison
Jason Allen	Intertek Testing Services
Dr. Roger Barker	North Carolina State University
Bill Burke	Fire-Dex
Steve Corrado	Underwriters Labs Inc.
Paul Curtis	ECMS, Inc.
Scott R. Doan	Alameda County, California Fire Department
Tim Durby	IFSTA
Richard Edinger	Chesterfield, Virginia Fire & EMS (IAFC)
Dave Fanning	Bullard
Bill Fithian	Safety Equipment Institute
Pat Freeman	Globe Manufacturing
Richard Granger	Charlotte, North Carolina Fire Department
Emeral Earl Hayden	El Paso, Texas Fire Department (IAFF)
Tricia Hock	Fire-Dex
Michael Laton	Sperian Protective Apparel
Karen Lehtonen	Lion Apparel
Mike McKenna	Sacramento, California Fire Department, retired
Daniel Melia	Fire Department City of New York
Lou Ott	Gentex Corporation
Matt Pegg	Ontario, Canada Association of Fire Chiefs
Tom Ragan	Shelby Specialty Gloves
John Rihn	MSA
Wendell Robison	National Volunteer Fire Council
Stephane Rouse	Sperian Protective Apparel
Robin Royster	Underwriters Labs Inc.
Angie Shepherd	NIOSH National Personal Protection Technical Laboratory
Kelly Sisson	La Mesa, California Fire Department
Harry P. Winer	HIP Consulting

Guests Present:

Chantal Adam
Don Aldridge
Karl J. Beeman
Holly Blake
Michael Boersen
Ron Bove
Wells Bullard
Scott Burbridge
Bryan Burton
Bill Candy
George Comer
Gary Denault
A. Shawn Deaton
Mark Dolim
Robert Dubé
Charles Dunn
Tom Flaherty
Tim Gardner
Chris Gaudette
Jim Gelrud
Bill Gorak
Tyler Griffith
Rick Griggs
Christine Habicht
Ira Harkness
Kimberly Henry
Diane Hess
Harrish Lilani
Bob Mercurio
Brent Merriam
Kirk Owen
Jim Reidy
Kathleen Rouse
Laura Russell
Shawn Russell
Marni Schmid
Tom Stachler
Jim Walter
Mark Williams
Jennifer Wise
Rich Young

Difco Performance Fabrics Inc.
Lion Apparel
Karl Beeman Inc.
W.L. Gore & Associates
STC Footwear Inc.
W.L. Gore & Associates
Bullard
Teijin Aramid USA
Stedfast Inc.
W.L. Gore & Associates
TenCate Protective Fabrics
Innotex Inc.
North Carolina State University
ECMS/L.N. Curtis and Sons
Louisa County Fire & EMS
TenCate Protective Fabrics
Reflexite
3M
Reflexite
Vista Fire Dept. / San Diego County Fire Chiefs
W.L. Gore & Associates
Sturges Mfg.
CAL FIRE / Riverside
TenCate Protective Fabrics
U.S. Navy
PBI Performance Products
PBI Performance Products
NORFAB Corp.
ESS Eye Pro
Cosmas USA
TenCate Protective Fabrics
Texas State Association of Fire Fighters
Teijin Aramid USA
DuPont
Phenix Technology
Fortunes Collide Marketing, LLC
Honeywell
Honeywell
W.L. Gore & Associates
W.L. Gore & Associates
DuPont

NFPA Staff Liaison Bruce Teele then read the NFPA Committee Operating Procedures, and passed out the sign-in sheets for both Members and Guests.

Agenda Item 4: Approval of the TC Minutes of the 13 – 15 April 2010 Meeting in New York City

MOTION BY BILL BURKE, SECOND BY HARRY WINER

To approve the Minutes of the 13 -- 15 April 2010 Committee meeting in New York, New York.

MOTION CARRIED

Agenda Item 5: Chairman’s Remarks

Chairman King reviewed the Agenda and objectives for the meeting. Chairman King stressed that this was the most critical meeting of the standards revision cycle and that all work must be completed by meeting adjournment.

The preparation work of the Task Groups was recognized by Chairman King and he expressed his appreciation for all of their efforts.

Chairman King noted that Agenda Item 6, last minute “Task Group Reports” will be removed. Instead, the Committee will proceed to go through the Logs in numerical order and determine the disposition. Chairman King requested that the TG leaders be prepared to highlight the critical issues as each Log is discussed. The Committee will record substantiation for each Log as it is discussed so we can thoroughly and expeditiously move through the ROP.

Agenda Item 6: Last Minute TG Reports

Agenda Item 6 will not be covered. The ROP document will be covered Log by Log, with Dave Trebisacci recording Committee actions in the NFPA travel file and Acting Secretary Mauti taking notes accordingly.

Agenda Item 7: Portable Radio Pocket Issues

NFPA received 3 or 4 requests for clarification on radio pocket flaps. Standards Administration has reviewed it and passed along to the General Council for their opinion. The General Council has not yet released their opinion.

Agenda Item 8: Actions on Public Proposals, Format for Actions on Public Proposals

Chairman King led the Committee through a review of the Public Proposals, moving in page number order through the document. Staff Liaison Dave Trebisacci took notes in the Travel File of all Committee actions and substantiations.

There was Committee discussion and several motions regarding action on certain Logs, which is noted as follows:

Discussion Log 83:

MOTION BY RICH GRAINGER, SECOND BY RICH EDINGER

To Reject Log 83 of the ROP Document

MOTION CARRIED

Discussion on the Issue of faceshield and helmet drooping during convective heat testing:

MOTION BY RICH GRAINGER, SECOND BY SCOTT DOAN

To submit a Committee Proposal on helmet and helmet faceshield droop during convective heat testing

HAND COUNT: 21 AFFIRMATIVE, 2 NEGATIVE

MOTION CARRIED

Discussion on Log 6:

MOTION BY EARL HAYDEN, SECOND BY STEVE CORRADO

To Accept in Principle Log 6

MOTION TO AMEND THE PRIMARY MOTION BY TIM DURBY, SECOND BY RICH GRAINGER

To revise Log 6 to read: The face opening shall be stretched from two points to a distance of 15 inches with no elastic or thread breakage

HAND COUNT: 8 AFFIRMATIVE, 11 NEGATIVE, 3 ABSTENTIONS

AMENDMENT TO THE PRIMARY MOTION FAILED

ON THE PRIMARY MOTION

HAND COUNT: 9 AFFIRMATIVE, 9 NEGATIVE, 4 ABSTENTIONS

PRIMARY MOTION FAILED

Discussion on Log 44:

MOTION BY HARRY WINER, SECOND BY PAT FREEMAN

To Accept Log 44

MOTION FAILED

Discussion on alternatives to removing the Shower Test:

MOTION BY TIM DURBY, SECOND BY KELLY SISSON

To Accept Committee Proposal CP13 as presented by the TG on Shower Test (CP documented in Travel File)

MOTION CARRIED

Discussion on Log 41:

MOTION BY PAUL CURTIS, SECOND BY BILL BURKE

To Reject Log 41

MOTION CARRIED

Discussion on Log 45:

MOTION BY ANGIE SHEPHERD, SECOND BY RICH EDINGER

To Reject Log 45

MOTION CARRIED

Discussion on Log 90

MOTION BY RICH GRANGER, SECOND BY ANGIE SHEPHERD

To Reject Log 90

MOTION CARRIED

Chairman King recessed the meeting for the day at 17.40 and informed the Committee that the meeting would reconvene at 08.00.

16 JUNE 2010

Chairman King reconvened the meeting at 08.00, 16 June. The Committee continued discussion on the ROP.

Discussion on Log 63 and Transmitted and Stored Thermal Energy test:

The Committee discussed this test at length, particularly the issue of whether to test patches. A small group will look at the issue and give their recommendations on 17 June.

Discussion on Log 70 and Total Heat Loss Test:

The Committee discussed this Log in detail. Shawn Deaton from NCSU presented a study conducted by his team that evaluated THL through two different sets of protective coats. They also completed an analysis of the number of layers above the basic three layer composite. Shawn showed his presentation of the THL evaluations to the Committee. Accepting this Log and moving to a THL requirement of 270 would eliminate the currently certified CBRN composite, but the Committee acknowledges that other composites may be available.

MOTION BY EARL HAYDEN, SECOND BY RICH EDINGER

To Reject Log 70

MOTION CARRIED

Discussion on Log 64:

MOTION BY ANGIE SHEPHERD, SECOND BY RICH GRANGER

To Accept in Principle Log 64 with the changes documented in the travel file.

HAND COUNT: 19 AFFIRMATIVE, 1 NEGATIVE, 1 ABSTENTION

MOTION CARRIED

Discussion on Log 55:

Dr. Roger Barker explained Log 55 which is based on a new test NCSU is developing. Objective evaluation criteria still need to be created. This new test could replace the current TPP test. This new test exposes the entire glove and wrist area to flame, and then evaluates what burns occur and where they occur. There was some discussion about the test procedure. Rich Granger stated that most of the hand burns they were seeing were compression burns on the palms or back of the hands. Shawn Deaton explained that during testing there is shrinkage of the glove which causes contact to the hand and may allow burns to occur. The test was designed to be a thermal insulation test to replace the TPP test and is not necessarily intended to cover all the compression criteria. Dr. Barker explained that this test looks at flame immersion. The primary intention is to replace the TPP test and some of the erroneous data that the existing test can provide.

Tom Ragan asked what the inside of the glove looks like after this exposure for protection against future exposure. Dr. Barker explained that repeated exposure is not part of the test, similar to today's tests. Some concerns were expressed about whether this test would result in thicker gloves causing a reduction in dexterity. Dr. Barker said that while more research is needed, his hope was that the understanding of the distribution of burns would allow for material to be removed from some areas and thickened in other areas, but would increase overall dexterity due to overprotection in some areas with today's gloves.

Primary coverage is in the hand and the wrist area, and a new sensor technology is being evaluated to measure thermal protection and burn injury in the finger area. The proposed flame test exposure is 360 degrees. There was a question about "real flame" exposure compared to the "test flame" exposure, and it was noted that real fires come from directional areas and that hands and wrists are typically not fully engulfed.

MOTION BY RICH GRANGER, SECOND BY HARRY WINER

To Reject Log 55

Discussion of the motion was to keep the Log "open" so research would be continued. If the research does not provide adequate protection, the Committee can take other action during ROC.

MOTION WITHDRAWN

MOTION BY TIM DURBY, SECOND BY KELLY SISSON

To Accept Log 55

MOTION CARRIED

Discussion on Log 54:

MOTION BY PAUL CURTIS, SECOND BY MIKE MCKENNA

To Accept in Principle Log 54, but using generic terminology rather than the term "PyroHands"

MOTION CARRIED

Discussion on Log 61:

MOTION BY KELLY SISSON, SECOND BY WENDELL ROBISON

To Reject Log 61

MOTION CARRIED

Chairman King recessed the meeting for the day at 18.30 and informed the Committee that the meeting would reconvene at 08.00 on 17 June.

17 JUNE 2010

Chairman King reconvened the meeting at 08.00, 17 June 2010.

The Committee continued to review Public Proposals. Once all Public Proposal Logs were addressed, the Committee then began to address Committee Proposals.

Agenda Item 9: Actions on Committee Proposals for 2012 Edition of NFPA 1971

The Task Group leaders led the Committee through a discussion and review of their respective Committee Proposals. All actions were documented by Staff Liaison David Trebisacci for inclusion in the NFPA travel file.

Discussion on Committee Proposal 36, Item 19 from the Helmets Task Group Report:

MOTION BY JOHN RIHN, SECOND BY DAVID FANNING

To Reject CP36

HAND COUNT: 7 AFFIRMATIVE, 13 NEGATIVE, 2 ABSTENTIONS

MOTION FAILED

The Committee continued to discuss and take actions on the Committee Proposals until all were accounted for.

MOTION BY TIM DURBY, SECOND BY RICH GRANGER

To approve all actions taken on the Public Proposals received, and all actions taken on Committee Proposals, and to submit these to a letter ballot of the Committee to become the Committee's official ROP.

MOTION CARRIED

Agenda Item 10: Old Business

There were no old business issues raised.

Agenda Item 11: New Business

Angie Shepherd announced that NIOSH, NIST, and NFPA/FPRF are holding a meeting on 27 - 28 July 2010 on SCBA facepiece testing at NIOSH-NPPTL in Pittsburgh. Angie welcomed interested parties to participate in the meeting.

Angie Shepherd announced that ASTM F23 is having a PPE symposium in June, 2011 in Anaheim California.

Chairman King announced that there should be a Technical Committee meeting to begin addressing NFPA 1851 revisions. The meeting could be in late 2010 or early 2011 and would last approximately 2 days. San Diego, Fort Lauderdale, San Antonio, and other cities were suggested as potential meeting locations.

Bruce Teele, the NFPA Staff Liaison for this TC, and the TCC on the Project on Fire and Emergency Services Protective Clothing and Equipment, announced his retirement from NFPA effective 31 December 2010. David Trebisacci of the NFPA Public Fire Protection Division will be the Staff Liaison, and will be Bruce's replacement.

Chairman King sought other New Business; none was forthcoming

Agenda Item 12: Adjournment

Chairman King then sought a Motion to Adjourn.

MOTION BY RICH GRANGER, SECOND BY HARRY WINER

To adjourn.

MOTION CARRIED

Chairman King adjourned the meeting at 17.20 on 17 June 2010.

Respectfully submitted,

Benjamin A. Mauti

Benjamin A. Mauti, Secretary
TC on SPFFPCE