

REVISED
SC #09-8-3-a
D#09-16



Amy Beasley Cronin
Secretary, Standards Council

12 November 2009

To: Interested Parties

Subject:

Standards Council Decision (Final):	D#09-16 (REVISED)
Standards Council Agenda Item:	SC#09-8-3-a
Date of Decision*:	6 August 2009
NFPA 20, <i>Standard for the Installation of Stationary Pumps for Fire Protection</i> , 2010 edition	

Dear Interested Parties:

At its meeting of 4-6 August 2009, the Standards Council considered an appeal on the above referenced matter.

Please note that a correction has been made to the final decision that was previously sent out on 13 August 2009 for Council agenda item #09-16(SC#09-8-3-a) on NFPA 20. Specifically, the only change is the last paragraph, regarding recusal. The rest of the decision remains unchanged.

The last paragraph was inadvertently omitted and reads as follows:

“Council Member Harrington recused himself during the hearings, deliberations and vote on this issue.”

Attached is the final decision of the Standards Council on this matter.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Amy Beasley Cronin".

Amy Beasley Cronin
Secretary, NFPA Standards Council

c: D. Berry, M. Brodoff, L. Fuller, J. Gamache, J. Moreau-Correia
Members, TC on Fire Pumps (FIM-AAA)
Members, NFPA Standards Council (AAD-AAA)
Individuals Providing Appeal Commentary

*NOTE: Participants in NFPA's codes and standards making process should know that limited review of this decision may be sought from the NFPA Board of Directors. For the rules describing the available review and the method for petitioning the Board for review, please consult section 1-7 of the NFPA Regulations Governing Committee Projects and the NFPA Regulations Governing Petitions to the Board of Directors from Decisions of the Standards Council. Notice of the intent to file such a petition must be submitted to the Clerk of the Board of Directors within 15 calendar days of the Date of Decision noted in the subject line of this letter.



Standards Council Decision (Final):	D#09-16 (REVISED)
Standards Council Agenda Item:	SC#09-8-3-a
Date of Decision*:	6 August 2009
NFPA 20, <i>Standard for the Installation of Stationary Pumps for Fire Protection</i> , 2010 edition	

At its meeting of 4-6 August 2009, the Standard Council considered an appeal from Gayle Pennel, Chair of the Technical Committee on Fire Pumps (TC), requesting the acceptance of Comment 20-2 in the 2010 edition of NFPA 20, *Standard for the Installation of Stationary Pumps for Fire Protection*. Comment 20-2 sought to further modify a proposed new Chapter 4, *Fire Pumps for High-Rise Buildings*. Specifically, the appellant seeks to reinstate new Section 4.3.1 requiring fire pumps operating in series and their controllers to be located within the same fire pump room.

As background, Proposal 20-3 recommended a new chapter, Chapter 4, *Fire Pumps for High-Rise Buildings*, that contained the requirement for the location of fire pumps and their controllers. This Proposal was accepted by the TC. Subsequently, Comment 20-2 recommended deletion of the new chapter. The Comment was accepted-in-principle-in-part by the TC, and the TC proposed language that further modified the new chapter, deleting some of text initially accepted in Proposal 20-3, The the requirement, however, for the location of fire pumps and their controllers was not deleted.

A Certified Amending Motion (CAM 20-1) seeking to return a portion of a report in the form anidentifiable part of Proposal 20-3 and related Comment 20-2 was made at the 2009 Association Technical Meeting (Tech Session). The identifiable part reads as follows:

4.3.1 Fire pumps operating in series and their controllers shall be located within the same fire pump room.

The amending motion was supported by the NFPA membership, but failed to pass the subsequent balloting of the TC. When a recommended amendment is not approved by the TC, the default recommendation of the codes and standards development process is that no change from the existing edition should occur, and the portion of the Report modified by the Association recommended amendment is returned to previous edition text. In this case, therefore, the default recommendation that comes to the Council is that the proposed new Section 4.3.1 will be deleted since it did not exist in the previous edition.

The appeal requests that the Standards Council take action other than that recommended by the full NFPA codes and standards development process. On appeal, the Standards Council accords great respect and deference to the NFPA codes and standards

development process. In conducting its review, the Council will overturn the result recommended through that process only where a clear and substantial basis for doing so is demonstrated. The Council has reviewed the entire record concerning this matter and has considered all the arguments put forth in this appeal. In the view of the Council, this appeal does not present a clear and substantial basis on which to overturn the results recommended by the NFPA codes and standards development process. Accordingly, the Council has voted to deny the appeal. The effect of this action is that the proposed new Section 4.3.1 requiring fire pumps operating in series and their controllers be in the same fire pump room will be deleted since it did not exist in the previous edition.

Council Member Harrington recused himself during the hearings, deliberations and vote on this issue.