27 August 2018

To: Interested Parties

Subject: Standards Council Decision (Final): D#18-7


Date of Decision*: 14 August 2018

Dear Interested Parties:

At its meeting of August 13-15, 2018, the Standards Council considered an appeal on the above referenced matter. The Council’s Final decision is now available and is attached herewith.

Sincerely,

Dawn Michele Bellis
Secretary, NFPA Standards Council

cc: S. Everett, L. Fuller, S. Gallagher, D. Hague, C. Duffy, R. Solomon
   Members, CC Automatic Sprinkler Systems (AUT-AAC)
   Members, TC Sprinkler System Installation Criteria (AUT-SSI)
   Members, NFPA Standards Council (AAD-AAA)
   Individuals Providing Appeal Commentary

*NOTE: Participants in NFPA’s standards development process should know that limited review of this decision may be sought from the NFPA Board of Directors. For the rules describing the available review and the method for petitioning the Board for review, please consult section 1-7 of the Regulations Governing the Development of NFPA Standards and the NFPA Regulations Governing Petitions to the Board of Directors from Decisions of the Standards Council. Notice of the intent to file such a petition must be submitted to the Clerk of the Board of Directors within 15 calendar days of the Date of Decision noted in the subject line of this letter.
SUMMARY OF ACTION (for convenience only; not part of official decision): The Standards Council voted to deny the appeal to overturn the responsible Committees’ ballot results on CAM 13-6, which rejects Second Correlating Revision No. 9, as passed on the floor of the NFPA Technical Meeting.

DECISION:
At its meeting of August 13-15, 2018, the Standards Council considered appeals from Lawrence Taylor of Schindler Elevator Corporation, Barbara A. Schultheis of Hesperia, California, Thomas Parrish on behalf of the Automatic Fire Alarm Association, Steven Lewis of RFI Enterprises, David McColl of Otis Elevator Company, John Darmanin of San Francisco, California and Sagiv Weiss-Ishai of the San Francisco Fire Department. The collective appeals request that the Standards Council overturn the amendment ballot results on Second Correlating Revision No. 9 for the 2019 Edition of NFPA 13, Standard for the Installation of Sprinkler Systems. Specifically, the appeals request that Council reject Second Correlating Revision No. 9 thereby eliminating the installation requirements of sprinklers in elevator pits.

As background, Second Revision No. 428, which related (in part) to a requirement to install sprinklers in elevator pits, failed Technical Committee ballot. Second Correlating Revision No. 9 proposed the same text that failed the Technical Committee ballot and passed the Correlating Committee unanimously. Mr. Sagiv Weiss-Ishai filed a Notice of Intent to Make a Motion (NITMAM) in accordance with the Regulations Governing the Development of NFPA Standards (“Regs”) which was certified by the Motions Committee as CAM 13-6. CAM 13-6 passed on the floor of the NFPA Technical Meeting by a vote of 321-203. However, the amendment ballot failed to achieve the necessary ⅔ affirmative vote of the Technical Committee necessary to recommend approval of the Association action. The Correlating Committee passed CAM 13-6 unanimously.

The Council has reviewed the entire record concerning this matter and has considered all the arguments put forth in these appeals. On appeal, the Council accords great respect and deference to the NFPA standards development process. In conducting its review, the Council will overturn the results of that process only where a clear and substantial basis for doing so is demonstrated. In the view of the Council, these appeals do not present any clear and substantial basis on which to overturn the results yielded by the NFPA standards development process. Accordingly, the Council has voted to deny the appeals. The effect of this action is that the text of Second Correlating Revision No. 9 is not included in the 2019 Edition of NFPA 13, Standard for the Installation of Sprinkler Systems.

As a final note, given the conflicting information presented about the fire risks in elevator pits and safety concerns for service providers and installers performing work in elevator pits, the Council encourages the Technical Committee to seek analysis of the issues by submitting a research proposal to the Fire Protection Research Foundation to gather more information on this subject.

Council Member James Quiter recused himself from the deliberations and vote on these appeals.